

August 7, 2023 Date:

Thomas B. Modica, City Manager To:

Reginald Harrison, Director, Disaster Preparedness & Emergency Communications From:

Mayor and Members of the City Council For:

Subject: Emergency Communications Staffing and Operations Study

The Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications is responsible for dispatching Police, Fire and Emergency Medical Services. In recent years, the challenges faced by the 9-1-1 dispatch center (Center) have grown dramatically, including an increased volume of calls, greater expectations by the public, and challenges in the recruitment and retention of skilled 9-1-1 dispatchers. Last year, Public Safety Dispatchers received more than 575,000 calls. This equates to 1,575 calls per day, or 65 calls every hour. Unfortunately, 50percent of these calls were for non-emergency assistance, taking precious time away from emergency calls.

The complexity of the emergency communications field has increased, especially in response to the public's evolving expectations for emergency assistance related to the COVID-19 pandemic, civil unrest, emerging social movements, and our homelessness crisis response, which often requires additional training and longer call times for our dispatchers. Coinciding with these trends, the recruitment and retention of 9-1-1 dispatchers have become increasingly difficult throughout the emergency communications industry. Our goal in overcoming those challenges is to provide a highly responsive, accurate, and customer-centered level of service.

In response to those challenges, the department retained the Matrix Consulting Group to conduct a staffing and operational study. The completion of the 9-1-1 Staffing Study is a major accomplishment, demonstrating the department's commitment to operational improvements through transparency, introspection, and openness to change. This staff-initiated study included a comprehensive analysis of the Center's workload and performance levels, staffing and supervision, scheduling and overtime utilization, recruitment and hiring practices, and training and quality assurance programs.

A link to the complete study can be found here. Additionally, an executive summary and recommendations made by the consultant including management's response to each recommendation are attached. The study makes 47 recommendations, many of which had been initiated prior to the study, or completed soon thereafter. Some of the recommendations require external approval prior to initiation, including the meet and confer process, changes to City of Long Beach (City) policy, increased financial commitments and/or will take significant time to implement.

The following operational improvements, begun before or during the study, have now been completed, and align with the study recommendations:

<u>Recruitment Coordinator</u> – Reprioritized an existing coordinator position to primarily focus on the recruitment of qualified candidates and retention of highly skilled dispatchers.

<u>Call Taker I</u> – New position initially trained in call-taking protocols only to expedite the training period and more quickly utilize staff in the Communications Center.

<u>Public Safety Non-Emergency Phone Tree</u> – Reduces the number of non-emergency calls to dispatchers, allowing staff to focus on the most urgent calls. Since implementation, this system has reduced the volume of non-emergency calls by 30 percent, saving dispatchers more than 14 hours of call time per day.

<u>Recruitment Incentive Program</u> – To assist in recruitment efforts, the Department offers a financial incentive of up to \$5,000 to new hires, paid out over an 18-month period.

<u>"JoinLB911" Campaign</u> – To improve recruitment and retention rates, the Department has developed a recognizable brand and distinct communication channels to attract new dispatcher candidates.

The Communications Center operates on a 24/7 model and is budgeted for 78 operations positions responsible for the immediate delivery of 9-1-1 emergency services.

FY 23 Budgeted Positions – 9-1-1 Emergency Communications

Position	Budgeted
Communications Center Officer	1
Communications Center Coordinator	3
Communications Center Supervisor	3
Public Safety Dispatcher IV (Spvr.)	11
Public Safety Dispatcher III (Spvr.)	4
Public Safety Dispatcher II	56
Total 9-1-1 Personnel	78

The Communications Center is currently staffed at 90 percent of budgeted positions, including 17 trainees. Coordinators have oversight of the training curriculum, shift scheduling, equipment maintenance and upgrades, and developing recruitment strategies. Supervisory positions have oversight of the daily Communications Center operations. A number of 9-1-1 dispatchers are cross-trained in both police and fire/EMS call-taking, which provides an enhancement to services and a streamlined experience for our residents. They receive specialty pay for this advanced skill set.

The City Manager's proposed FY 24 budget recommends the following enhancements that will improve operational efficiencies within the Communications Center:

- Addition of one Communications Center Supervisor to provide additional oversight
- Reinstate two Public Safety Dispatcher II positions to pre-COVID-19 levels

Emergency Communications Staffing and Operations Study August 7, 2023 Page 3

Staff are encouraged by the results of the study and take the recommendations seriously. In some areas, the study validates current operational processes, and in others, it makes recommendations for operational enhancements. It is the intent of staff to implement recommendations in an expeditious manner. For those recommendations that involve external stakeholders, we will initiate an approval process in a timely manner.

If you have questions or require additional information, please contact Reginald Harrison, Department Director, at ext. 9460 or reginald.harrison@longbeach.gov.

ATTACHMENT

cc: Dawn McIntosh, City Attorney
Douglas P. Haubert. City Prosecutor
Laura L. Doud, City Auditor
Linda F. Tatum, Assistant City Manager
Teresa Chandler, Deputy City Manager
Tyler Bonnano-Curley, Acting Deputy City Manager
April Walker, Administrative Deputy City Manager
Meredith Reynolds, Special Deputy City Manager for Recovery
Kevin Lee, Chief Public Affairs Officer
Monique De La Garza, City Clerk
Department Heads
Meredith Dawson, Administration and Grants Officer
Melina Runnels, Acting Communications Center Officer

1. Introduction and Executive Summary

The Matrix Consulting Group was retained by the City of Long Beach Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (DPEC) to conduct a staffing and operational study of the emergency communications center. This study involves an analysis of the center's workload and performance levels, staffing and supervision approach, scheduling and overtime utilization, recruitment and hiring practices, and training and quality assurance programs. The following report summarizes the analysis, findings, and resulting recommendations.

1.1 Study Background

DPEC was formed in 2014, combining the previously separate functions of disaster preparedness, 911 communications, police dispatch, and fire dispatch into a single department. The Department's Emergency Communications Division serves the City of Long Beach as a primary PSAP and dispatch center for police, fire, and emergency medical services (EMS) response. The center has an operating budget of approximately \$9.6 million dollars and answered more than 750,000 phone calls in 2021 while dispatching more than 275,000 calls for service.

The center is budgeted for 74 operations staff which include call-takers, dispatchers, and supervisors. These are supported by a Communications Center Officer, an Administrative Coordinator, a Training and Tactical Coordinator, and a Systems Coordinator. The police communications center (PCC) and the fire communications center (FCC) dispatchers work separately and report to separate shift supervisors, although they are part of the same department and their workstations are in adjacent rooms. Some staff have been cross-trained in both police and fire/EMS call-taking, but most staff specialize in either police or fire dispatch functions.

Due to a high rate of vacancies and staffing shortages, the center has recently faced difficulty in reaching minimum staffing levels and has been forced to rely heavily on overtime. This study is focused on identifying strategies and recommendations for optimizing the efficiency of staffing and operations at the center while prioritizing public safety and maintaining a high level of service to first responders and the public.

1.2 Methodology

The project team undertook a number of tasks in the course of this study to ensure a thorough understanding of the communications center and develop analysis of the relevant issues. The study included the following activities:

- Collected data and documentation of the center's operations and staffing, including budget information, organizational charts and staff hiring and separations data, policies and procedures, overtime and leave use, staff training, workload related to phone calls, non-emergency communications, calls for service, technology systems, and performance measurement. This data was reviewed and analyzed for use in developing conclusions and recommendations.
- Conducted a series of confidential one-on-one interviews with staff, including the Department Director, the Communications Center Officer, the Administration and Grants Officer, the Operations and Systems Coordinators, and supervisors and staff in the PCC and the FCC.
- Took an in-person tour of the Department's facility and the communications center, and sat with dispatch staff in the PCC and the FCC in real time to observe operations.
- Conducted an electronic opinion survey of the center's staff. This survey, to which 53% of staff responded, was used to gauge employee sentiment on a number of topics relevant to the study including employee satisfaction, performance management, and the center's strengths and improvement opportunities.
- Conducted a comparative survey of 19 other emergency communications agencies, primarily in Southern California. This survey focused on staffing, scheduling, governance structure, recruitment and hiring, training, quality assurance, and technology use.
- Conducted quantitative analysis of call volume and CAD incident volume to develop a model of workload and determine the necessary number of staff to accommodate it at a high level of performance.

Interim deliverables were developed to present the results of these data collection and analytical tasks to the Department. These included a descriptive profile, analysis of employee survey results and the comparative survey, staffing and workload calculations, and an initial assessment of the issues in each topic area. These were provided to the Department during the course of the study to solicit feedback, provide insight into analysis process, and frame conversations regarding the findings and conclusions.

1.3 Key Findings

Since the Department's formation in 2014, its intention has been to implement a more modernized and consolidated operating model for emergency communications. The Department was formed under the centralized leadership of a civilian Director, and a memorandum of understanding was developed which established the goals, intended outcomes, and future plans for the new arrangement. These included eliminating the need for call transfers, cross-training all call-taking staff, and realizing economies of scale. The organizational structure was designed to support consolidation; rather than separate police and fire dispatch managers, operations staff report to an Operations Coordinator who oversees both disciplines. Additionally, the Department implemented a single shared computer-aided dispatch (CAD) system for both police and fire dispatching.

The Department today is equipped with a number of fundamental strengths. It is situated in a spacious, well-equipped facility which is conducive to good working conditions. It is also one of the few agencies in Southern California which operates an internal training program that is certified through the State's Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST).

In recent years, the challenges faced by the Department have grown. The number of calls for service has steadily increased, creating greater workload volume for staff. The service expectations of the public have remained high, and the increasing complexity of the emergency communications field has resulted in improved capacity for highly responsive and accurate service while also placing increased demand on staff. Coinciding with these trends, staff recruitment and retention have become increasingly difficult throughout the emergency communications industry, and the Department has been no exception in this regard. The City Auditor's Office conducted a review of the Department in 2016 which focused on staffing and overtime. This study identified the need for additional staff at the time, as well as improvements to recruitment, employee turnover, and the scheduling of overtime. The Department has taken a number of steps to proactively meet these challenges:

• To better direct inbound workload and allow call-takers to focus on the most highurgency needs, the Department has instituted a phone tree for non-emergency calls. This system provides access to commonly-requested non-emergency services while still allowing callers to speak with a call-taker if they request it. The system has reduced the volume of non-emergency calls by 30%, saving the center more than 14 hours of call time per day.

- To assist in recruitment efforts, the Department has secured approval to offer a financial incentive of up to \$5,000 to new hires at defined intervals over the course of their first 18 months of employment. The Department has also resumed offering information sessions and conducting recruitment at a schedule of community events.
- To improve recruitment and retention rates, the Department has developed a recognizable brand and distinct communication channels for hiring. The seals of the Department and the Communications Division have been updated to include emergency communications symbolism, and branded items and apparel have been produced and distributed with the updated seal. The Department has also updated the website with this seal and linked <u>JoinLB911.com</u> to the dispatcher careers page so that it can be used for recruitment efforts.
- To make more efficient use of personnel, the Department has secured approval to begin cross-training new hires as police and fire call-takers under the PSD I classification. This approach is different from the previous approach which trained new hires in both call-taking and dispatch, but only for police or fire. The new approach will help to alleviate staffing shortages, allowing new hires to fill positions on the schedule more quickly since their training will take several weeks rather than several months. It will also help the center take an important step toward full consolidation of police and fire dispatch.

In the coming year, the Department should focus on two broad objectives. The first is to effectively recruit and retain staff, and the second is to take substantive new steps toward a fully consolidated police and fire communications model¹. These two objectives are interrelated: alleviating staffing shortages will increase the margin available for training and implementation of a new operational model, and a fully cross-trained workforce will in turn reduce the impact of staffing shortages.

The first steps toward achieving these objectives have already been taken. The Department's recent moves have begun the process of addressing the issues of staffing and consolidation, as described above. The next steps will build on this foundation and capitalize on its current momentum as the Department works toward an increasingly stable, efficient, and capable future state.

Current Staffing and Scheduling: Before the next round of shift bidding occurs, the
 Department should adjust the center's hourly minimum staffing targets to better

¹ A fully consolidated model will be one in which police and fire dispatch operations are co-located on the same dispatch floor under a single shift supervisor, and enough dispatchers and supervisors have been cross-trained that FCC call-takers no longer need to be scheduled because the need for call transfers from primary call-takers to fire/EMD trained call-takers is eliminated.

align with the daily fluctuation of workload as described in Chapter 3, and a new shift schedule should be implemented which more closely and evenly aligns with those targets as described in Chapter 4. This will allow the center to achieve better coverage of call and incident volume, particularly during peak hours.

- Co-location: While the 2015 MOU intended for the Department to become fully consolidated, the PCC and FCC have remained functionally and physically separate. To emphasize the necessity of a unified approach and make crosstraining and cooperation between the two centers easier, the Department should relocate the fire/EMS workstations to the main dispatch floor with the PCC.
- Cross-Training: The Department's new initiative to hire and cross-train PSD I call-takers represents an important step toward the fully consolidated operational model. The Department should use the training program adjustments and increased staffing associated with the PSD I's as an opportunity to increase the consistency and pace of cross-training for veteran staff.
- Recruitment: The hiring of a new Administrative Coordinator and the progress
 already made in branding and recruitment present an opportunity to strengthen
 and grow the Department's recruiting program. This will be especially effective if
 the Department involves a wide group of staff in leading the effort and streamlines
 key elements of the hiring process such as testing and background checks.
- Staff Retention: Just as important as hiring new staff, retaining existing personnel
 allows the Department to keep staffing numbers up. The Department can improve
 in this area by expanding and systematizing its employee recognition efforts,
 emphasizing staff accountability in the post-pandemic era, and conducting a
 compensation study to remain competitive in the talent market.
- Performance: The Department should emphasize professionalism and high levels
 of service by adopting performance level targets for dispatch operations,
 expanding and formalizing the ongoing training program, and initiating a more
 extensive and wide-ranging approach to quality assurance.

Recommendations from 9-1-1 Staffing and Operations Study

The chart below documents consultant recommendations from the 9-1-1 staffing study. Where applicable, the consultant provided a timeline and cost estimate to implement the recommendation. Some of the recommendations have a note from staff to provide clarity and/or context. Some of the recommendations require the Meet and Confer process, policy change, additional funding, and/or additional time prior to implementation. Additionally, we have provided a management response to each recommendation. See footnote for management response descriptions.

Staffing and Scheduling				
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response
2.31	The Department should aim to maintain an occupancy rate of no greater than 50% for dispatch staff and 60% for call-takers.	\$ -	1-3 months	1
	Note : Occupancy Rate is the percentage of time in which dispatchers are occupied with call-taking, radio work, or engaged in other tasks. The average Occupancy Rate for Long Beach dispatchers is 50 percent.			
3.51	The Department should adjust hourly minimum staffing targets to better reflect fluctuation of workload throughout the day.	\$-	1-3 months	1
	Note : Agree. Staffing levels fluctuate based on call volume and is actively monitored.			
4.51	The Department should adopt a shift schedule which aligns more closely and evenly with hourly minimum staffing targets.	(\$32,900/yr)	1-3 months	1
	Note : Agree. Staffing levels fluctuate based on call volume and is actively monitored.			
3.52	The Department should seek to realize a fully consolidated operating model which utilizes a single bank of fully cross-trained call-takers.	(\$640,500/yr)	2+ years	1
	Note: Agree. Training underway.			
4.61	The Department should carefully monitor the impact of PSD I call-takers on shift-by-shift staffing need and adjust hiring and scheduling accordingly.	\$-	3-6 months	2
	Note: Agree. The new PSD I classification was approved on May 8, 2023.			

7/19/2023

1 = Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 – Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Organ	Organizational Structure				
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response	
5.11	The Department should plan for an eventual consolidated dispatch model with one supervisor and at least two PSD IV assistant supervisors on duty in each shift.	\$ -	6-12 months	1	
	Note : Agree. Shift Supervisors are included in the cross-training program.				
5.12	The Department should require cross-training for shift supervisors before appointing them to a shift over the fully consolidated communications center.	\$ -	6-12 months	1	
	Note : Agree. Shift Supervisors are included in the cross-training program.				
5.21	The Department should remove the FCC from its own room and co-locate it with the PCC on the main dispatch floor.	\$ -	3-6 months	1	
	Note : Agree. Staff will occupy one room once we have a significant percentage of cross-trained dispatchers.				
5.31	The Department should place its new Administrative Coordinator over its recruitment, hiring, training, and quality assurance programs.	\$ -	1-3 months	2	
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.				
5.32	The Department should adjust the roles of the Administrative Analyst II, Operations Coordinator, and Communications Center Officer to align with those assumed by the new Administrative Coordinator.	\$ -	1-3 months	2	
	Note: Agree. Will implement once Administrative Analyst is hired.				

Recruitment and Hiring

1 = Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. **2** = Agree. **3** – Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. **4** = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. **5** = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. **6** = Under consideration.

#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response
6.11	The Department should assign oversight of recruitment efforts and hiring process enhancements to the soon-to-be-hired Administrative Coordinator position and empower that position to develop and orchestrate the elements of the center's recruitment program.	\$ -	1-3 months	2
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.			
6.12	The Department should establish a staff recruitment committee to develop, execute, and champion the program under the leadership of the Administrative Coordinator.	\$ -	3-6 months	2
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.			
6.21	The Administrative Coordinator and committee assigned to recruitment should develop a strategic recruitment plan and identify metrics for gauging the effectiveness of the organization's recruitment efforts.	\$ -	3-6 months	2
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.			
6.22	The Administrative Coordinator and committee overseeing recruitment should maintain an updated list of contacts and applicants and prioritize direct conversations and relationship building with them.	\$ -	3-6 months	2
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.			
6.23	The Administrative Coordinator and committee over recruitment should continue developing a brand identity for the center and materials which illustrate the organization's values.	\$ -	3-6 months	2
	Note : Agree. Recruitment Administrative Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.			

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Recrui	tment and Hiring			
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response
6.33	The Department should contract with a private vendor for POST compliant background investigations.	\$120,000	1-3 months	3
	Note: Agree. Currently in discussion with the Police Department.			
6.41	The Department should initiate an employee recognition plan which uses quality assurance reviews and post-event evaluations to identify instances of exceptional performance and formally commend staff.	\$ -	3-6 months	4
6.42	The Department should issue physical patches or pins to staff who reach milestones or successfully handle defined categories of high-stakes incidents, and should publicly highlight staff receiving acknowledgements for their work.	\$500	3-6 months	4
	Note : Department recognizes employees through service pin ceremonies, Employee of the Month, "Service Excellence" on website, and employee features in department newsletters.			
6.43	The Department should speak with any staff who exhibit a clear pattern of usage consistent with sick leave abuse.	\$ -	6-12 months	3
	Note: In discussion with Human Resources.	_		
6.44	The Department should strengthen its policies on attendance and tardiness by clearly defining the terms so that they can be consistently enforced.	\$ -	3-6 months	3
	Note: In discussion with Human Resources.			
6.45	The Department should internally publish rates of leave and overtime on a monthly basis.	\$ -	3-6 months	2
	Note : Agree. Key performance indicators reviewed weekly by supervisory staff. Department is determining appropriate key performance indicators to share with all staff.			
6.51	The Department should consider an update to its compensation study in order to enhance competitiveness in recruitment and retention.	\$850,000/year	3-6 months	3
	Note: In discussion with Human Resources.			

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Trainir	ng			
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response
7.11	The Department should place a limit on the number of PSD I positions who may be employed at a given time.	\$ -	1-3 months	2
	Note: Agree. New PSD I classification was approved May 8, 2023.			
7.12	The Department should encourage and incentivize PSD I call-takers to complete radio training and advance to the PSD II classification when they are ready and able.	\$ -	6-12 months	2
	Note: Agree. New PSD I classification was approved May 8, 2023.			
7.13	The Department should use PSD I training sessions on police and fire/EMS call-taking as an opportunity to cross-train PSD II classification when they are ready and able.	\$ -	6-12 months	2
	Note: Agree. New PSD 1 classification was approved May 8, 2023.			
7.21	The Department should consider a nationally recognized dispatch training certification such as the APCO Public Safety Telecommunicator certification as a basis for its multidisciplinary call-taker training program.	\$7,600/yr	3-6 months	5
	Note : Department requires Police Officer Standard Training (POST) and Emergency Medical Dispatch (EMD) certifications. In addition, staff attends various APCO training classes.			
7.22	The Department should revise and consolidate its comprehensive training manual as an up-to-date reference document for use in the training process.	\$ -	1-3 months	4
	Note : Police and Fire Dispatchers each have their own specifically designed training manuals that are periodically updated.			
7.23	The Department should develop standard evaluation guidelines to use as a grading scale for each assessment component.	\$ -	1-3 months	4
	Note : 9-1-1 trainees are provided daily observation reports by training officers that document their progress.			
7.25	The Department should offer a pay differential for CTO's which is consistent without regard to their position or classification.	\$12,000/yr	6-12 months	3
	Note: In discussion with Human Resources.			

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Training	Training				
Recomn	nendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response	
7.26	The Department should consider professional dispatch management certification programs for Coordinator and Manager level staff in the organization. *Note: Department requires Police Officer Standards Training (POST) and Emergency Medical Dispatch (EMD) certifications.	\$1,000	1-2 years	5	
7.31	The Department should develop a system for routine in-service staff training which is interactive and focuses on low-frequency, high-stakes skills. Note: In addition to in-service trainings, dispatchers also participate in Continuing Education courses.	\$ -	3-6 months	4	
7.33	The Department should offer advanced training certificates for dispatchers when staffing capacity permits. *Note: Many staff members currently hold Intermediate and Advanced certificates, and Training certificates, through Police Officer Standards Training (POST).	\$5,000/year	1-2 years	4	

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Perforn	Performance and Quality Assurance				
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response	
2.21	The Department should adopt the standard of processing 90% of high priority calls for dispatch within 90 seconds.	\$ -	Immediate	6	
	Note : Processing time is determined by the time it takes to gather accurate information from the calling party to enter a call for service. This time can be affected by language translation, clarity of the cell phone connection, and the nature of the call. There is no existing national or state standard for processing time. Long Beach currently enters 75% of high priority calls within 90 seconds.				
2.22	The Department should track its fire/EMS dispatch processing performance against the NFPA standard of processing 90% of high priority calls for dispatch within 64 seconds. Note: Department works under the standards set forth by the Long	\$ -	Immediate	4	
	Beach Fire Department's Emergency Medical Services Division.				
2.41	The Department should use its quality assurance program as one of the core inputs for performance evaluations.	\$ -	3-6 months	4	
	Note : Quality assurance data is an integral component of the performance evaluation process.				
2.42	The Department should use performance evaluations as one of the core inputs for the development of ongoing training materials. *Note: Performance evaluations data is used in determining in-service*	\$-	3-6 months	4	
0.54	and on-going training.	фт. ооо	4.0	_	
2.51	The Department should consider pursing accreditation through CALEA and/or IAED in addition to its current accreditations.	\$5,000	1-2 years	5	
	Note : Department requires Police Officers Standards Training (POST) and Emergency Medical Dispatch (EMD) certifications.				

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Perfor	Performance and Quality Assurance				
Recon	nmendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response	
7.41	The Department should increase the volume of quality assurance reviews and expand quality assurance to include nonmedical fire calls and radio traffic along with 911 law enforcement and medical calls. *Note: The Department follows guidance set forth by FD Medical Division and randomly reviews 6 calls per month per Fire Dispatcher of actual fire and medical calls. Department randomly selects 30 minutes of calls (could equate to 5-8 calls) for quality assurance of each Police Dispatcher every quarter.	\$-	6-12 months	6	
7.42	The Department should use quality assurance reviews as a data source to identify agency-wide trends and opportunities for improvement. These should be used as source material for developing staff training sessions on these topics. *Note: Quality assurance data is an integral component of the training development process.	\$ -	3-6 months	4	

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.

Techn	Technology					
#	Recommendation	Estimated Cost (Savings)	Timeline	Management Response		
4.71	The Department should implement a scheduling software system to replace the current manual method of paper and Excel spreadsheets.	\$12,000/year	3-6 months	2		
	Note: Agree. In discussion with potential vendors.					
6.24	The Department should modify its recruitment web page to focus on personal conversation with someone at the center and include links to FAQs, key explanations, and social media channels.	\$-	1-3 months	4		
	Note: Agree. Recruitment Coordinator was hired on May 8, 2023.					
6.25	The Department should utilize its Instagram page and business cards as channels for increasing exposure and engaging with interested candidates.	\$500	\$500 1-3	\$500	1-3 months	4
	Note : Launched Join LB 9-1-1 campaign on June 1, 2022, which include these outreach tactics.					
6.31	The Department should conduct dispatcher aptitude testing inhouse at the communications center. Products such as CritiCall and the NDST should be evaluated as solutions.	\$1,000/year	3-6 months	3		
	Note: In discussion with Civil Service.					
7.24	The Department should complete, share, and track daily observations reports electronically.	\$ -	6-12 months	6		
	Note : Some DORs are completed electronically, while some are handwritten. All DORs are reviewed and tracked by the Operations Coordinator and maintained by the Department for 5 years.					
7.32	The Department should implement a web-based digital system for managing its internal ongoing training program.	\$1,800/year	6-12 months	4		
	Note : In-Service Training and ongoing training is completed through the City's training portal, POST portal (Police Dispatchers), and Vector Solutions (Fire Dispatchers). All training is tracked by the Operations Coordinator.					
7.43	The Department should consider dedicated quality assurance software to manage the expanded scope and volume of reviews.	\$35,000/year	6-12 months	6		

^{1 =} Agree; requires increased staffing and/or decreased call volume. 2 = Agree. 3 - Agree; requires policy change and/or meet and confer process. 4 = Agree; recommendation is completed, substantially completed, or in process. 5 = Will consider in addition to current affiliations, certifications, and memberships. 6 = Under consideration.