Date: December 14, 2021

To: Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Thomas B. Modica, City Manager

Subject: Update on the Long Beach Justice Fund

As directed by the City Council on December 4, 2018, City staff implemented a two-year contract with the Vera Institute of Justice (Vera) to manage the Long Beach Justice Fund (Justice Fund). The Justice Fund provides legal representation to low-income individuals residing or working in Long Beach and are facing deportation. This memorandum serves as an update on the Justice Fund’s outcomes and next steps.

Progress to Date

The City contracted with Vera to serve as the fiscal sponsor and program manager of the Justice Fund. Through a request for proposal (RFP) process run by Vera in March 2019, Immigrant Defenders Law Center (ImmDef) was selected to provide legal representation services to eligible individuals and began providing these services in June 2019. A detailed description of their efforts and outcomes is provided in Attachment A. Vera committed to serve as the fiscal sponsor and program manager for the first two years of the program. Upon completion of their contract term on October 31, 2021, the Office of Equity in the City Manager department took over program management responsibilities to continue implementation of the Justice Fund.

Long Beach Justice Fund Annual Report

Beginning in 2019, the City of Long Beach (City) became one of only a few cities in California advancing a legal defense fund for immigrants facing the threat of deportation. ImmDef has been providing legal defense to Long Beach residents primarily through referrals from Long Beach Immigrant Rights Coalition (LBIRC), among a few other sources.

Since April 30, 2019, the Justice Fund has accepted 38 cases. Clients of the Justice Fund come primarily from Mexico (47 percent) and Guatemala (28 percent). The remaining clients hail from Cambodia, Cuba, El Salvador, Honduras, Kazakhstan, and Nigeria. Of those clients who are pursuing some legal defense, most (84 percent) are pursuing protection-based claims such as asylum. Five (13 percent) of the accepted Justice Fund cases have been completed in immigration court, and though 61 percent of the Justice Fund’s clients have filed motions and applications for deportation defense, many of the cases remain pending due to a national backlog in immigration case proceedings.

The COVID-19 pandemic posed significant impediments for ImmDef in deportation defense work, causing delays and access issues to existing and prospective clients. Closure of the Los Angeles non-detained court has resulted in case delays projected into 2023. To adapt to the complexities of the immigration legal landscape as well as the added COVID-19 related barriers, Vera, ImmDef, and the City opted for a no-cost six-month extension of the current contracts in order to continue providing services through the end of October 2021.
Long Beach Justice Fund Oversight Committee

During the first year of implementation, the Office of Equity facilitated the development of the Long Beach Justice Fund Oversight Committee (Committee), comprised of stakeholders actively engaged in monitoring and advising the implementation of the Justice Fund. The Committee membership consists of representatives from the City, Vera, LBRIC, Long Beach Sanctuary Coalition, Southeast Asian Anti-Deportation Collective, ImmDef, and impacted members of the community. The Committee convenes quarterly to represent key stakeholders and immigrant communities and to provide guidance and direction throughout the Justice Fund’s implementation process.

In response to the challenges posed by COVID-19, the Committee recommended adding a Community Connection Services component to the Justice Fund. Community Connection Services will entail a local community-based organization that will provide referrals to the Justice Fund legal service provider, serve as a liaison with client’s families, and provide referrals to community services.

Funding and Future Programming

The seed funding for the Justice Fund pilot consisted of $250,000 in one-time funds allocated in FY 19 and a $100,000 catalyst grant from Vera. All funding has been expended during the two-year pilot. During the FY 21 budget process, the City Council allocated an additional $300,000 in structural funding toward the Justice Fund, which remains unspent due to the two-year pilot duration and the additional six month no-cost extension. This $300,000 allocation will support legal services and community outreach during FY 22. The City released a Request for Proposals (RFP) for these services to continue the Justice Fund, and selected Immigrant Defenders Law Center (ImmDef) to provide direct legal representation to immigrants facing removal. The City has selected Long Beach Immigrant Rights Coalition (LBIRC), Centro CHA, and St. Mary Medical Center Foundation (Families in Good Health) to provide outreach, education, and other coordination services. These four organizations will work collaboratively to effectively implement the Justice Fund.

The Office of Equity is working with the Justice Fund Oversight Committee to plan how the additional $300,000 of American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funding will be used over the course of FY 22 and FY 23.

If you have any questions please contact Deputy City Manager Teresa Chandler at teresa.chandler@longbeach.gov or at (562) 570-5116.
The SAFE Initiative is a growing movement of communities convened by the Vera Institute of Justice (Vera) that are dedicated to publicly funded, universal representation for immigrants facing detention and deportation.¹ Universal representation advances a public defender system for people facing deportation, one in which every person facing deportation is represented by a lawyer regardless of income, race, national origin, or history with the criminal justice system. Such programs are more important now than ever.

Immigrants facing deportation do not have the right to a public defender if they cannot afford a lawyer. Yet, the government trying to deport them always has counsel.

The obstacles facing unrepresented immigrants are substantial. Immigration law is among the most complex areas of American law—it has been described by federal courts as “labyrinthine” with one former immigration judge saying that an immigration case “often involves life and death consequences [that] amount to death penalty cases heard in traffic court settings.”² Immigrants in detention, like those served by the Long Beach SAFE program, are particularly defenseless—detained immigrants are at an increased risk of contracting COVID-19, the least likely to secure representation, and the most vulnerable to deportation.³ The loss of liberty and free movement that characterize detention introduce additional obstacles into the already daunting process of an individual trying to represent themselves effectively. Especially amid the current public health crisis, the stakes for immigrants in detention could not be higher.

As a result, most people fighting for their lives in immigration court—including 70 percent of people in detention nationwide—navigate the complexities of immigration law alone.⁴ At the Adelanto Immigration Court, which hears the cases of SAFE’s Long Beach detained clients, 71 percent have gone unrepresented over the last five years. Over the past 20 years, this number is even starker, with 86 percent of cases in Adelanto lacking representation.⁵

In response, communities like Long Beach are advancing universal representation through the SAFE Initiative and are leading the way toward restoring fundamental fairness and dignity to everyone facing deportation.
I. Background

The Long Beach SAFE Program
Long Beach is the first and only city in Los Angeles County—and one of only a handful of cities in California—providing legal defense to immigrants facing deportation through a merits-blind, universal representation model. A product of the hard work of Long Beach government leaders and community advocates, Long Beach voted to create a legal defense fund for immigrants in December 2018.

In April 2019, the government of Long Beach announced $250,000 for the fund, along with a one-time catalyst grant of $100,000 from the Vera Institute of Justice, to keep the program funded from May 2019 through April 2021. After completing a competitive and detailed application process, the Immigrant Defenders Law Center (ImmDef) was selected to provide legal services to immigrants as part of the Fund. Vera’s contract with ImmDef was recently extended through October 31, 2021, at no cost to the City, for reasons due to the COVID 19 pandemic, which are detailed below. Vera has administered the Fund at no cost to the City since May 1, 2019, drawing on its experience administering similar funds across the nation.

Immigrant Defenders Law Center’s Two Years in SAFE
ImmDef began accepting Long Beach clients on May 8, 2019. ImmDef has dedicated a staff attorney to focus solely on Long Beach clients and a paralegal to spend 45 percent of their time on the needs of clients served by the Fund.

Originally, ImmDef was contracted to provide legal services to immigrants from Long Beach whose cases were before the Los Angeles non-detained courts, and to those detained at the Adelanto Detention Center (Adelanto, CA), the Theo Lacy Detention Facility (Orange, CA) and James M. Musick Detention Facility (Irvine, CA). When Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) stopped using the latter two facilities in 2019, ImmDef shifted to only providing services to immigrants detained in Adelanto. In early 2020, a new immigration court opened in
van Nuys, CA, and ImmDef shifted to provide representation to Long Beach residents whose cases are heard there.

ImmDef’s priority is to provide high-quality representation and to preserve a client’s dignity in an otherwise unequal justice system. ImmDef attorneys advocate zealously on behalf of their clients, particularly so that clients can be released from detention. At times, what is considered “successful” about a case may not be a grant of relief from deportation, but rather ensuring that a client is treated with respect and allowed an opportunity to make educated decisions regarding the outcome of their case. ImmDef attorneys work to ensure that their clients’ dignity is preserved and that they and their families are informed and prepared for whatever difficult decisions they may have to make.

Figure 2. SAFE Initiative Program Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal Service Provider:</th>
<th>Immigrant Defenders Law Center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Populations Served:</td>
<td>Residents of Long Beach or those employed in Long Beach; those who were residents of, or were employed in, Long Beach immediately prior to detention by ICE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detention Centers Served:</td>
<td>Adelanto Detention Facility (Adelanto, CA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method of Identifying Clients:</td>
<td>Community referrals; Legal Orientation Programs (LOP) at Adelanto Detention Facility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic

The COVID-19 pandemic has had a significant impact on the clients (and potential clients) served by the Fund.

For several reasons, it has been challenging to find clients who need the services of the Fund, despite extensive outreach by ImmDef and LBIRC. As a result of closures to the detention centers in Orange and Irvine, as well as litigation requiring the reduction of people detained at Adelanto to allow for social distancing, the detained population has greatly decreased from the initial time the Fund was created. A federal court order in the Roman v. Wolf class action limited Adelanto’s capacity from nearly 2,000 people to 475, with the actual numbers of people detained hovering at fewer than 200 at times throughout the past year. Further, the Legal Orientation Program, which previously served as a referral source for people in detention, continues to do phone-only consultation because of the pandemic. Non-detained master calendar hearings also largely continue to be suspended. From March through September 2020, the Los Angeles non-detained courts shut down entirely, delaying cases into 2023. As a result, non-detained intakes have slowed down because potential clients are not seeking representation for court dates so far into the future. For all these reasons, the City, Vera, and ImmDef agreed to extend the contracts to provide services through the Fund for six months at no cost to the City.

It is more difficult to meet with existing clients, particularly those who face grave danger while in custody. The lives of clients detained at Adelanto are at stake due to repeated COVID-19 outbreaks at the facility—likely exacerbated by a lack of testing and proper health care, the inability to social distance in crowded dorms, and no or limited personal protective equipment and soap. In response, ImmDef has spent considerable time and resources trying to get clients out of detention. However, ImmDef attorneys have limited access to their clients due to COVID-19 restrictions at Adelanto, often preventing them from meeting with their clients in person. Attorneys are instead forced to communicate with their clients by phone—if at all—despite barriers to clients accessing confidential phone lines for weeks on end. This makes the attorneys’ work on each case much more resource and time intensive than it was before the pandemic.
Impact of Trump’s “Migrant Protection Protocols” (AKA “Remain in Mexico Program”)

Over the past year, ImmDef has seen an increased need to represent both detained and non-detained people who have already been ordered removed from the United States. During the Trump administration, many immigrants faced an expedited removal process called the “Migrant Protection Protocols,” which proceeded so quickly that immigrants could not obtain an attorney, resulting in their deportation. Many people who were detained at Adelanto, as well as families appearing non-detained in Los Angeles, were subjected to this process. Many of these individuals now face imminent threat of removal without attorneys who could potentially file a motion to reopen their cases or offer other types of assistance. Accordingly, ImmDef has expanded the scope of its representation to people with final orders of removal who are otherwise eligible for the Fund, and for whom filing a motion to reopen is appropriate.

Referrals

In addition to the Legal Orientation Program at the Adelanto Detention Facility, the Long Beach SAFE program also receives referrals from the community. The list below, although non-exhaustive, is a record of other sources of referrals:

- Long Beach Immigrant Rights Coalition (LBIRC)
- Los Angeles Justice Fund legal service providers
- Calls to Immigrant Defenders Law Center’s central phone line and walk-ins by clients or family members of clients
- Referrals from current clients, including detained individuals who may know another individual with Long Beach ties that could benefit from program
- Various stakeholders within Long Beach, including the City of Long Beach and Long Beach Community Defense Network

Figure 3 below depicts additional information regarding the status of client referrals as of April 30, 2021.

Figure 3. Source and Status of Referrals to the Long Beach SAFE Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Clients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accepted Cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From LBIRC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pending Cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From LBIRC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declined Cases*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From LBIRC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cases</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Referrals may be declined for a variety of reasons. For example, the individual may have already had an attorney, been transferred by ICE out of Southern California, declined representation, or been ordered deported before the referral.
II. SAFE by the Numbers

The statistics in this report cover clients represented under Long Beach SAFE program from May 1, 2019 (the beginning of data collection in Long Beach) to April 30, 2021. These statistics should be considered preliminary, based on just two years of data and a limited sample size.

Leveling the playing field

By advancing the universal representation model, the city of Long Beach and ImmDef help to ensure that everyone has an equal chance of being represented by an attorney, regardless of their background.

> Since the inception of the SAFE program in Long Beach, ImmDef has represented 28 clients with Long Beach residency, helping to level the playing field for immigrants who otherwise would have gone to court alone.
> The 28 clients represented in Long Beach hail from eight countries—primarily Mexico (43 percent) and Guatemala (29 percent). The remaining clients hail from Cambodia, Cuba, El Salvador, Honduras, Kazakhstan, and Nigeria. Universal representation helps ensure that people from diverse backgrounds are equally eligible for representation and given the opportunity to have a fair day in court.

Long Beach clients as community members

SAFE clients and their families are part of the fabric of Long Beach communities. Representation through SAFE has radiating impacts that extend beyond those directly represented.

> Like the nationwide trend in the SAFE Initiative, the 28 clients represented in Long Beach have longstanding ties to the United States. On average, clients have lived in the country for 17 years.7 On average, clients have lived in the country for 17 years.
> Many clients first came to the United States as children or young adults. Sixty eight percent of clients arrived before their 25th birthday and 50 percent arrived when they were 18 or younger.
> Over a third (43 percent) of Long Beach’s SAFE clients are parents. Collectively, Long Beach clients are parents to 23 children under the age of 18 living in the United States, most of whom are U.S. citizens (61 percent).

The road to freedom

Representation through the SAFE program in Long Beach helps people secure release from detention and reunite with their families and communities.

> Since the inception of the program, 40 percent of clients whose cases began in detention were released from custody, either on bond or at the conclusion of their legal cases. Because some people are subject to mandatory detention—meaning they are not eligible for bond and must remain in detention while removal proceedings are pending against them—this statistic should be viewed in that context and could never be 100 percent. Moreover, this statistic should be considered in the context of the two years of this program where many cases remain unfinished.
> People in immigration court face steep costs to obtain release from custody, even if granted bond. Immigration court bonds are determined without clear guidelines or regard for a client’s income. For

“There are still so many people who are stuck in detention and don’t have lawyers. Now, with COVID-19, they really need people to support them. It is really awful to be in those places. I don’t know why I was released, but I was very lucky.”

—Ana, ImmDef client
Long Beach clients granted bond, the average bond amount was $18,250, although bonds were set as high as $23,000. On average, ImmDef clients were asked to pay 46 percent of their annual household incomes in exchange for the right to fight their cases from outside of custody. 8

> Attorneys help clients receive lower bonds. Among ImmDef clients who were granted bond, 80 percent were either granted a bond when one had not originally been set or were granted a lower bond amount after the attorney’s intervention.

> Attorneys support continued appearance in immigration court. All Long Beach clients released from custody have continued to appear for their scheduled court hearings, underscoring the senselessness of civil detention, particularly for those who have legal counsel. By contrast, those without counsel to help them navigate the process are far less likely to appear in court. 9

The impact of due process on case outcomes

Representation ensures that clients have a chance to advance a defense and that an immigration judge can evaluate the merits of their cases.

> Over the course of the program, 18 percent (N=5) of Long Beach SAFE client cases have completed in immigration court. Although the immigration court backlog has now surpassed one million cases nationwide, cases involving people who are detained move more quickly. If attorneys do not intervene quickly, cases could end with people being deported without any opportunity for legal access.

> In the last year, nearly two-thirds of clients of the Long Beach SAFE program (61 percent), have pursued some legal defense against deportation through motions or applications. Several of these cases remain pending. Other clients have either opted to pursue voluntary departure or accept an order of removal, or may be preparing applications that have not yet been filed. Of those clients who are pursuing some legal defense, most (82 percent) are pursuing protection-based claims such as asylum.

The figure below depicts the current case status and outcome of cases for each of Long Beach’s SAFE clients.

Figure 4. Case Status and Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Status</th>
<th>Number of Clients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pending Cases</td>
<td>23 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currently Detained</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currently Non-Detained</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases that Began Non-Detained</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Released from Detention</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closed Cases</td>
<td>5 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases Completed in Immigration Court</td>
<td>5 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary Departure</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of Removal</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Termination</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cases</td>
<td>28 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“There are so many of us who need legal assistance. If I hadn’t had a lawyer, I would have felt totally alone and without support. I would probably have given up and agreed to be deported.”

- Ana, ImmDef client
III. CLIENT STORIES

Rot is a Laotian-Cambodian refugee who escaped from the Cambodian genocide as a child. His family resettled in Long Beach, and most of his family still currently resides there. As a result of the war and having to relocate to a new country, Rot’s family encountered challenges adjusting to their new life. Rot sought acceptance and belonging through his friends and his gang. At sixteen years old, Rot got into trouble with the criminal legal system, and he was tried as an adult and convicted of a felony. He served 29 years in prison. Meanwhile, he dedicated himself to self-help programs to turn his life around, in hopes of reuniting with his family upon his release from prison. Rot was granted parole in February 2020. Upon release from prison, he was immediately transferred to the Adelanto detention center. Rot’s medical conditions, which include being a cancer survivor, placed him at high risk of getting COVID-19 while in detention. With the help of his Long Beach Justice Fund attorney, he won release from detention and currently resides in Long Beach. ImmDef is currently representing him on appeal.

Carlos* has been a Long Beach resident since approximately 2006. He has cognitive issues from a traumatic brain injury, which include a loss of short-term memory. Carlos has two children, who are minors and U.S. citizens, and an ex-partner with whom he is still very close. Carlos’s partner reached out to ImmDef for assistance, but, unfortunately, Carlos had already been ordered removed—without ever having his mental capacity evaluated as required by the law. Upon speaking with Carlos and getting help from his bunk mates at Adelanto, ImmDef discovered that Carlos should have been a Franco v. Gonzalez class member, which provides federal-government funded counsel to immigrants who are unable to represent themselves due to a mental disability. ImmDef is currently advocating to get Carlos an attorney through Franco v. Gonzalez. Meanwhile, ImmDef is also evaluating his legal right to a bond hearing and to a motion to reopen his case before the Board of Immigration Appeals.

Ana* fled violence and threats in Guatemala with her son, and could not afford a lawyer when she ended up in detention and deportation proceedings. Here is her story:

In detention, we had to sleep on concrete benches or the floor because there were so many of us. I was cold and so sad to be there. Sometimes they gave us a little mattress, but there were never enough of them. They give you aluminum to wrap yourself in, but it doesn’t warm you. Sometimes, you don’t sleep.

I brought my son from Guatemala so that he could have a better life here in the United States. He was being threatened by gangs where we lived. They showed up at our house with weapons looking for him. They threatened to hurt him and kill me if he would not join. My poor nephew had been killed by one of the gangs, and so we believed their threats. I was especially vulnerable as a woman and knew I could be killed by the gangs who wanted my son or by the same people who murdered my nephew and were still angry at our family. I could not let my son be hurt or be forced to join the gang, so we fled. Coming to the United States was a very hard journey that took one month. We traveled through Mexico. Sometimes we ate; sometimes we did not.

When we crossed into the United States and were in the desert, we saw the headlights of the immigration cars. They asked us what we were doing, and we said that we wanted asylum. They sent us to a detention facility, which was a terrible place.

They separated me from my son after we were detained. I was in a cell with other women like me, and my son was with young kids like him. I couldn’t see him, and I was so sad and worried. It was so sad that there were so many children there, all closed in. It just fills me with sadness to remember hearing them cry.
There are still so many people who are stuck in detention and don’t have lawyers. Now, with COVID-19, they really need people to support them. It is really awful to be in those places. I don’t know why I was released, but I was very lucky. When I got out, someone gave me the phone number for Long Beach Justice Fund. They provided me with an attorney free of charge to help me file a claim for asylum.

In the claim, we told the judge that it is not safe for us in Guatemala because we are the target of gangs and people who have resisted gang recruitment. Guatemalan women who oppose association with gangs are in great danger.

I was happy to have the opportunity to speak at public meetings to ask the government to provide more funding for the Long Beach Justice Fund so that they can help more people like me. There are so many of us who need legal assistance. If I hadn’t had a lawyer, I would have felt totally alone and without support. I would probably have given up and agreed to be deported.

My son is happy now; he is not afraid of anything. He says that it is different here. My hope is that we can win our asylum request and stay in the United States. My dream is that we can have a better life in this country.

*Some names have been changed to protect client privacy.

---

Endnotes

1 The Safety and Fairness for Everyone (SAFE) Initiative includes Alameda County, CA; Atlanta, GA; Austin, TX; Baltimore, MD; Chicago, IL; Columbus, OH; Dallas, TX; Dane County, WI; Denver, CO; Long Beach, CA; Madison, WI; Oakland, CA; Philadelphia, PA; Prince George’s County, MD; Ramsey County, MN; Sacramento, CA; San Antonio, TX; San Francisco, CA; Santa Ana, CA; and St. Paul, MN. Cook County, IL and New Haven, CT are also partnered with SAFE and striving towards public funding for removal defense. For additional information, see Vera Institute of Justice, “Safety and Fairness for Everyone (SAFE) Initiative,” vera.org/safe-initiative. For more on universal representation, see Vera Institute of Justice, “Advancing Universal Representation: A Toolkit for Advocates, Organizers, Legal Service Providers, and Policymakers,” https://www.vera.org/advancing-universal-representation-toolkit.


4 The representation rate in immigration court fluctuates slightly over time. Historically, 81 percent of detained immigrants have lacked representation—between October 2000 and November 2019, 81 percent of all people in detention had never been represented (1,237,252 of 1,526,419 cases). The rate has improved slightly over the past two decades, with approximately 70 percent unrepresented in recent years—between October 2012 and November 2019, 70 percent of all people in detention had never been represented (327,828 of 466,756 cases), with the exact percentage varying slightly from year to year. See Transactional Records Access Clearinghouse (TRAC), “Details on Deportation Proceedings in Immigration Court,” accessed January 13, 2020, https://trac.syr.edu/phptools/immigration/nta/.

5 Of the more than 7,800 detained cases (N=7,873) heard before the Adelanto Immigration Court over the previous five fiscal years (FY16 through FY20), over 5,500 (or 71 percent) were without the assistance of counsel (N=5,568). These numbers do not include individuals whose cases have been re-categorized as “released” after being granted bond. See Transactional Records Access Clearinghouse (TRAC), “Details on Deportation Proceedings in Immigration Court,” accessed May 14, 2020, https://trac.syr.edu/phptools/immigration/nta/.


8 To be eligible for representation under SAFE, a client’s household income cannot exceed 200 percent of the federal poverty level.