City of Long Beach
Working Together to Serve

Memorandum

Date: June 18, 2019

To: Mayor and Members of the City Council

For: Patrick H. West, City Manager

Subject: **Security Guard Services – Proposition "L" analysis**

At its February 19, 2019 meeting, the City Council was requested to adopt Specifications No. ITB LB18-123 (Specifications) and award a two-year contract to GSSi, Inc., dba General Security Service, of Wilmington, CA, for providing security guard services to City facilities where such services were already in place and to facilities where no security services where in place, including on an "as needed" basis. The City Council requested a Proposition "L" analysis for these services and approved a six-month contract with GSSi, Inc., while that analysis was being completed.

The attached report provides that analysis. Since City employees have never provided security guard services at these facilities, the analysis makes reasonable assumptions as to how these services would be provided by City employees. The analysis is conservative in that it likely somewhat understates actual City costs. The estimated annual costs using City employees to provide security guard services in the Specifications is $2,116,650. The total cost to providing the same service by way of the GSSi, Inc. contract is $909,000. To provide the service using City staff would be a 133 percent premium (2 1/3 times the cost of providing it by contractor). The level of service would be approximately the same, although the private security guard services have the advantage of great scheduling flexibility and efficiency that maximizes security coverage and provides the best financial efficiency. This level of savings is consistent with previous Proposition "L" findings for security guard services in both 2001 and 2006.

Human Resources Department Labor Relations staff will meet with representatives of the International Association of Machinists (IAM) in response to their request to "meet and confer" on this matter.

Given the findings of the analysis, I will be recommending the City Council approve a multi-year contract for security guard services with GSSi, Inc.

Attachment

CC: CHARLES PARKIN, CITY ATTORNEY
LAURA DOUD, CITY AUDITOR
TOM MODICA, ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER
KEVIN JACKSON, DEPUTY CITY MANAGER
REBECCA GARNER, ADMINISTRATIVE DEPUTY TO THE CITY MANAGER
MONIQUE DE LA GARZA, CITY CLERK (REF. FILE #18-1074)

Security Guard Services

Proposition "L" Analysis:
Contractor-Provided Security Guard Services Based on
GSSi, Inc. Contract Approved on February 19, 2019

This is a City Council requested update of a Propositions L analysis of Security Guard services. A Proposition L analysis for Security Guard services was done in 2001 and again in 2006. This update is based on the costs and service levels identified in the approved February 19, 2019 contract with GSSI, Inc. (see Attachment A).

BACKGROUND

Proposition "L"

In 1979, the electorate passed a ballot measure known as Proposition "L" which added Section 1806 to the City Charter. That Charter section permits the City Council, after certain findings, to adopt an ordinance by a 2/3 vote as a precondition to authorizing contracts with private contractors for the performance of work or services usually performed by employees of the City. The ordinance must determine, supported by findings, that the work or service proposed to be contracted out for can be performed by a private contractor as efficiently, effectively, and at an estimated lower cost to the City than if said work or services were performed by City employees. In addition, the ordinance must indicate that it has been determined that the proposed contract for work or services will not be detrimental to the best interest of the citizens of the City.

Previous Security Guard Services Proposition L Findings

Proposition "L" findings (ordinances) were made for security guard services contracts in 2001 and 2006. These findings showed that the specified services, if provided by City employees, would be 137 percent and 147 percent more expensive, respectively, than if provided by the contractor. (City employee-provided services would be more than double the cost of contractor-provided services.) The contracts for security guard services approved by the City Council in 2011 and 2014 were based on Proposition "L" findings from 2001 and 2006.

At no time have City employees provided security guard services at any of the sites contained in the contracts prior to their award. Additionally, the contracts allowed for the addition and deletion of sites as required by the City.

Special Services Officers

The City job classification for employees providing non-Police security and safety services is Special Service Officer (SSO). There are four grades of the SSO classification, I-IV:

Grade Level I	Performs routine guard work at a desk or in buildings or areas which are either secured or where the frequency of public contact is practically nil - OR - performs various duties in the Police Department including the supervision of Trustees on outside work details. Note: There are no SSO I positions currently budgeted in any department as employees are automatically upgraded to SSO II upon the successful completion of probation.
Grade Level II	Performs responsible patrol work occasionally requiring quick, independent decisions and where there is frequent public contact.
Grade Level III	Participates in the work of and serves as shift lead person over subordinates - OR - oversees the work and conduct of persons detained in custody.
Grade Level IV	Heads a bureau or department unit of security personnel - OR - supervises subordinates engaged in overseeing the work and conduct of persons detained in custody.

SSOs are used in a variety of capacities across the City organization, all playing very important roles in the security and safety of the City's assets, its workforce, and its patrons. A summary of SSO assignments is provided below.

Police Department

The are 122 full-time SSOs budgeted in the Police Department (including those to be transferred from the Long Beach Airport). Employees in these positions may be assigned to one of the following operations:

- ***Jail:*** Ensures inmate safety and facility security. Conducts searches, classification assessment, inmate medical screening, fingerprinting and DNA collection if applicable, performs inspections\security checks of the jail and Civic Center, supervises all inmate movement, monitors electronic audio and video surveillance equipment, transports inmates to medical and county facilities, escorts inmates to court and provides courtroom security, prepares written reports, log entries, and incidents reports.

- ***Marine Patrol:*** Assists the public in person or by telephone; maintains control and preserves the security of the City's marinas and beaches; enforces rules, regulations and laws within the marina areas; booking of arrested persons; patrol area in marked city vehicles; and provide community-based policing.

- ***Long Beach Airport***: In the FY 2019 Budget, 27 SSOs were transferred from the Airport to the Police Department to integrate all security operations at the Airport under the Police Department. The actual transition of staff is currently underway. Airport SSOs are first responders to all public safety and security incidents at the Airport. The primary mission of the Security Division is to support the Transportation Security Administration (TSA) with counter-terrorism efforts.

- ***Long Beach City College:*** Responsible for the security of campuses, its faculty and students by patrolling the grounds on foot, bicycle, Segway and/or in a city vehicle. Escorts students, faculty and other employees; responds to suspicious activity, emergency situations, property damage and unlawful activity on District property; responds to calls for service involving thefts, disturbances, vandalism and malicious mischief; provide first aid as needed.

- ***Civic Center Security*:** Responsible for the security of the Civic Center and safety of its staff and visitors. Provides building security and screening of visitors attending City Council meetings. Responds to suspicious activity, emergency situations, property damage, and unlawful activity on the premises; responds to calls for service involving disturbances and vandalism.

Harbor

There are 65 full-time SSOs budgeted in the Harbor Department. Employees in these positions are assigned to the Harbor Patrol. Duties include the enforcement of designated sections of the California Penal and Vehicle Codes, the Long Beach Municipal Code and the Port of Long Beach Tariff/Ordinances.

Long Beach Airport

In the FY 2019 Budget, 27 SSOs were transferred from the Airport to the Police Department to integrate all security operations at the Airport under the Police Department. The actual transition of staff is currently in process. Five (5) full-time SSOs remain budgeted in the Airport Department. Duties currently include dispatch, recording calls for service in CAD, and staffing the Airport's access control and perimeter security systems.

Public Works

There are 22 full-time SSOs budgeted in the Public Works Department, Parking Enforcement Division. However, these positions are the residual of the transfer of citywide parking enforcement from the Police Department to the Public Works Department. These positions are now cross-filled with employees in the Parking Control Checker II classification.

COST ANALYSIS

Pursuant to the City Council's request, staff has endeavored to prepare a comparative cost analysis of the services contained in Specifications No. ITB LB18-123 (Specifications). The adoption of a new ordinance is not required to award a new contract for security services.

This cost comparison for a Proposition L analysis for the 2019 GSSi, Inc. contract used the scope of work identified in the associated RFP and developed a staffing model that could provide those services with City employees. This needed to be done because the City is not currently providing these services, so an existing staffing model could not be used. The model likely understates City costs a bit because it assumes the use of less expensive non-career (NC) employees where less than full-time work is done. While this is reasonable, it is not clear that such a model is practical over the long-term, and a more expensive model may, in fact, be used. However, even with this lower cost model, services provided by City employees would be significantly more expensive than contractor-provided services.

Comparison Considerations

There are several key factors that need to be considered when making a comparison between contractor-provided services and City employee-provided services. They are as follows:

- The services provided by the contractor are based on a set number of work hours (schedule) specified for each site/facility. A contractor's employee will be on site every work hour specified. In short, every paid hour is a work hour. The contractor's renumeration is based on the actual number of work hours that are provided to the City.
- A full-time City employee is paid for 2,088 hours per year, but will not work that many hours as he/she has the benefit of paid time off (vacation, sick leave, holidays, etc.). Thus, when making a comparison based on a set time schedule, every hour the employee does not work, must be backfilled by another employee. For example: If an employee uses 10 vacation days, takes 8 sick days, and gets 13 paid holidays, he/she is only working 1,840 hours per year, or an average of 35 hours per week. Thus, for a comparison based on a set time schedule, another employee must provide the hours not provided by the primary employee, and the costs of those additional hours must be included in the analysis.
- The contractor's billable hourly rate will include a factor for supervision. As such, a factor for supervision should also be included in the City's costs. Similarly, the contractor's billable hourly rate will include account for materials, supplies, and equipment needed by the contractor's employees. The City's costs should also include these.

Contractor Pricing

The Specifications requested pricing and qualifications for both regular, scheduled services at 10 sites and as-needed services. Bidders were asked to provide hourly rates for specified hours of services. GSSi, Inc. (Contractor) was deemed to the lowest responsible bidder. (This company is the current provider of security guard services.) On February 19, 2019, staff recommended a contract be awarded in the annual amount of $909,000. This amount was based on requests from departments needing regular, scheduled services and/or as-needed services. The chart below identifies the total hours specified, the Contractor's hourly rates, and the total cost for each category of service.

Categories of Service	Total Hours	Hourly Rate	Total Cost
Regular, Scheduled Services: Non-Holidays (8 sites)	37,909	$18.79	$712,310
Regular, Scheduled Services: Non-Holidays (2 sites)	602	23.26	14,003
Regular, Scheduled Services: Holidays (8 sites)	432	28.19	12,178
Regular, Scheduled Services: Holidays (2 sites)	126	33.26	4,191
As-Needed Services: Non-Holidays*	8,851	18.79	166,310
TOTAL	**47,920**	**--**	**$909,000**

* As-needed hours were estimated based on the remaining contract authority after regular, scheduled service hours were accounted for. The actual number and type of hours provided may differ. An estimate was needed for comparison purposes.

Building a City Staffing Model

The Contractor provided the City with a staffing plan for the sites contained in the proposed contract that require regular, scheduled service (not including as-needed services). This staffing plan provides for as many full-time positions as possible, and, as such, it was used as the basis for the City's staffing model (see Attachment B).

A conceptual staffing model requires that certain assumptions be made. They are as follows:

- When a regular weekly work schedule totals 40 or more hours per week, a full-time employee will perform the work.
- When a regular weekly work schedule totals 30 to 39 hours per week, a "permanent, part-time" employee will perform the work.
- When two employees are on the same shift, they will stagger meal and rest breaks and coverage drops to one during those times.
- When security guard services at a given site are provided by a single employee, the employee will not leave the site during meal and rest breaks, but will be available to respond, if needed.
- Hours needed beyond those worked by full-time or "permanent, part-time" employees will be provided by non-career (part-time) employees.
- Work hours not provided by full-time or "permanent, part-time" employees on paid leave (VA, SL, HO) will be provided by non-career (part-time) employees, except holidays when facilities are closed.
- Costs are based on Step III of the SSO II classification. The costs were taken from the FY 2019 Budget. The chart below identifies the costs for 1 FTE of a full-time SSO and 1 FTE (2,088 work hours) of a part-time, non-career SSO.

SSO II, Step III	Salary	Benefits	Total	Loaded Hourly Cost
Full-Time (Avg.)	$47,806	$34,145	$81,951	$39.25
Part-Time, Non-Career (Avg.)	$46,766	$7,039	$53,805	$25.77

- Average annual work hours for full-time SSO II employees are based on the class average for all SSO IIs for 2018, which is 1,788.
- All as-needed services will be provided by non-career (part-time) employees.
- Supervision is calculated at a ratio of 1 supervisor to 10-12 employees. Supervision will be provided by the SSO IV classification (Step III).

Regular, Scheduled Services

The following would be required to meet the staffing requirements for regular, scheduled services:

Classification	FTEs	Comments
Special Services Officer II, Full-time	15.00	1,053 overtime (OT) hours would also be required.
Special Services Officer II, Perm./Part-time	3.18	1@ 31 hrs/wk; 3 @ 32 hrs/wk
Special Services Officer II, NC, Scheduled Hours	0.85	1,768 hours
Special Services Officer II, NC, Backfill Hours	1.99	4,145 hours
Special Services Officer IV, Full-time, Supervisor	2.00	
Total	**23.02**	

As-Needed Services

The following would be required to meet the staffing requirements for as-needed services:

Classification	FTEs	Comments
Special Services Officer II, NC, As-Needed Hours	4.24	8,851 hours
Total	**4.24**	

City Costs

Provided below are the estimated annual costs for City employees to provide security guard services based on the aforementioned assumptions.

Personal Services Costs	FTE	Salary	Benefits & WC	Total
Special Services Officer II, Full-time	15.00	$717,094	$512,175	$1,229,269
Special Services Officer II, Perm./Part-time (31/wk)	0.78	36,607	21,902	58,509
Special Services Officer II, Perm./Part-time (32/wk)	2.40	112,638	67,389	180,027
Special Services Officer II, NC (Scheduled & Backfill)	2.84	132,815	19,992	152,808
Special Services Officer II, NC (As-Needed Services)	4.24	198,288	29,848	228,136
Special Services Officer IV, Full-time, Supervisor	2.00	121,335	77,874	199,209
Special Services Officer II – Overtime Hours (1,053)	--	35,507	1,895	37,402
Total Personal Services	**27.26**	**$1,354,284**	**$731,075**	**$2,085,359**

Non-Personal & Internal Services Costs	No.	Unit Cost	Total
Uniforms, Boots, Gear (FT, PPT, NC)	25	$2,489	$62,225
Handheld Radios	17	950	16,150
Vehicles (Supervisors)	2	8,208	16,416
Total Non-Personal & Internal Services Costs			**$80,291**

TOTAL ANNUAL CITY COSTS	**$2,116,650**

It should be noted that there would also be some one-time costs if City employees were to provide the specified services. These costs, which are identified below, are not included in the Total Annual City Costs. While these are "one-time" costs, training costs, would need to be periodically repeated.

One-Time Costs	No.	Unit Cost	Total
Pre-Employment Investigations	25	$1,900	$47,500
Training	25	2,954	73,850
Handheld Radios - Initial Acquisition	17	3,000	51,000
Vehicles – Initial Acquisition	2	31,156	62,312
Total One-Time Costs			**$234,662**

Cost Comparison Results

The estimated annual costs to provide security guard services with City employees based on the GSSi, Inc. contract is $2,116,650. The total annual cost to contract out for the same services is $909,000. The city cost is 138 percent higher or much more than twice the cost of contracting out (2.38 times). This cost premium for using City employee-provided services is consistent with the Proposition "L" findings (Ordinances) for security guard services contracts in 2001 and 2006.

CONCLUSION

The use of contracted-out security guard services for the locations and functions described in the GSSI, Inc. contract is significantly less expensive and provides comparable services than could be provided by City employees in the SSO classification, the classification best suited for security guard services. In addition, the use of contractual services provides a level of flexibility to meet needs that would not be available with City employees.

Attachments

BID SECTION

PRICES TO BE INPUT ELECTRONICALLY IN PLANETBIDS

All services shall be FOB Destination City of Long Beach. Pricing shall include all costs associated with this service.

	Location	Days	Hours	Number of Guards Per Shift	Number of Hours per Week	Non-Holiday Cost Per Hour	Holiday Cost Per Hour	# of Radios Required
	ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT							
1	Career Transition Center/Youth Opportunities Center 4811 Airport Plaza Dr. 90815	Monday - Friday	Overlapping: 7:00 am - 4:00 pm	1	40	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	2: Guard 14: City Staff
		Monday - Friday	Overlapping: 10:00 am - 7:00 pm	1	40			
		Some Saturdays	As-Needed	1	As-Needed			
		As-Needed	As-Needed Car Patrol	1	As-Needed	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	None
2	Community Hospital of Long Beach 1720 Termino Ave. 90804	7 days	24 Hours	2	168	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	2: Guards
	HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES							
3	Main Health Facility 2525 Grand Ave. 90815	Monday	7:00 am - 8:00 pm	2 (to be split)	13	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	2: Guards 14: City Staff
		Tuesday - Friday	7:00 am - 7:00 pm		48	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	
		Saturday (average of 3 times per month)	7:30 am - 1:00 pm		5.5	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	
4	Housing Authority Bureau* 521 E 4th St. 90802	Monday - Friday	7:00 am - 5:45 pm	1	53.75	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	1: Guard 1: City Staff
5	Multi Service Center 1301 W 12th St. 90813	Monday - Friday	Overlapping: 7:00 am - 4:00 pm	1	40	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	3: Guards 18: City Staff
		Monday - Friday	Overlapping: 8:00 am - 5:00 pm	2	80	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	

ATTACHMENT A

BID SECTION

6	Miller Family Health & Education Center (FHEC) 3820 Cherry Ave. 90807	Monday - Friday	2:00 pm - 6:00 pm	1	20	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	None
	LIBRARY SERVICES DEPARTMENT							
7	Burnett Neighborhood Library 560 E Hill St. 90806	Tuesday & Thursday	1:00 pm - 7:00 pm	1	29	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	None
		Wednesday	1:00 pm - 6:00 pm					
		Friday	1:00 pm - 5:00 pm					
		Saturday	Noon - 5:00 pm					
		Sunday	Noon - 4:00 pm					
8	Mark Twain Neighborhood Library 1401 E Anaheim St. 90813	Tuesday	2:30 pm - 7:30 pm	1	27	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	1: guard 3: City staff
		Wednesday	1:30 pm - 6:30 pm					
		Thursday	2:30 pm - 7:30 pm					
		Friday - Saturday	12:30 pm - 5:30 pm					
9	Michelle Obama Neighborhood Library 5870 Atlantic Blvd. 90805	Tuesday	Noon - 7:15 pm	1	41	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	None
		Wednesday	Noon - 6:15 pm					
		Thursday	Noon - 7:15 pm					
		Friday - Saturday	10:00 am - 5:15 pm					
	PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT							
10	Public Service Yard 1651 San Francisco Ave. 90813	Monday - Friday	11:00 pm - 5:00 am	1	14	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	1: guard 1: City staff
		Saturday	7:00 pm - 5:00 am					
		Sunday	7:00 pm - 5:00 am					

BID SECTION

11	Freeway Yard East side of the 710 Freeway, between Anaheim Street and Pacific Coast Highway, access is off the southbound Pacific Coast Highway off-ramp from the northbound 710 Freeway.	Patrol - part of Public Service Yard route.	Same as Public Service Yard (above)	1				None
12	Environmental Services Bureau (ESB) 2929 E. Willow St. 90806	As-Needed	As-Needed	1	As-Needed	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	N/A
	PARKS, RECREATION & MARINE DEPARTMENT							
13	Parks, Recreation and Marine (Various locations)	As-Needed	Various	2	As-Needed	$ Enter Electrically	$ Enter Electrically	None

Bidders shall specify Minimum Hours Required Per Call _____

Bidders shall specify Hours or Days Lead Time _____ (Circle Hours or Days)

Security Services - GSSi, Inc

Staffing Plan with City Equivalent Positions

FACILITY OR LOCATION	EMPLOYEE NAME	WORK SCHEDULE	HOURS/ DAY	FT/PT	SUN	MON	TUES	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	TOTAL
Burnett Neighborhood Library	Employee A	1200-1600	4	Part-Time	4							4.00
Burnett Neighborhood Library		1300-1900	6	Part-Time			6					6.00
Burnett Neighborhood Library		1300-1800	5	Part-Time				5				5.00
Burnett Neighborhood Library		1400-1900	6	Part-Time					6			6.00
Burnett Neighborhood Library		1200-1700	5	Part-Time						5	5	10.00
Career Transition Center/Youth Opportunities	Employee B	1000-1500	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Career Transition Center/Youth Opportunities	Employee C	0700-1600	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee D	0800-1600/1600-0000	8	Full-Time	8	8	8				8	32.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee E	0800-1600/1600-0000	8	Full-Time	8			8	8		8	32.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee F	0000-0800	8	Full-Time			8	8	8	8		32.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee G	0800-1600	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee H	1600-0000	8	Full-Time	8	8	8			8	8	40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee I	0800-1600	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee J	0000-0800	8	Full-Time	8	8	8	8			8	40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee K	0000-0800	8	Full-Time	8	8			8	8	8	40.00
Community Hospital of Long Beach	Employee L	1600-0000	8	Full-Time	8			8	8	8	8	40.00
Housing Authority Bureau	Employee M	0700-1745	10.75	Full-Time		10.75	10.75	10.75	10.75	10.75		53.75
Main Health Facility	Employee O	1200-2000/1000-1900	8 or 9	Full-Time		8	9	9	9	9		44.00
Main Health Facility	Employee N	0700-1200/0700-1000	3 or 5	Part-Time		5	3	3	3	3		17.00
Mark Twain Neighborhood Library		1430-1930	5	Part-Time			5		5			10.00
Mark Twain Neighborhood Library		1330-1830	5	Part-Time				5				5.00
Mark Twain Neighborhood Library		1230-1730	5	Part-Time						5		5.00
Mark Twain Neighborhood Library		1300-1730	4.5	Part-Time							4.5	4.50
Michelle Obama Neighborhood	Employee P	1200-1630	4.5	Full-Time	4.5							4.50
Michelle Obama Neighborhood		1200-1930	7.5	Full-Time			7.5		7.5			15.00
Michelle Obama Neighborhood		1200-1830	6.5	Full-Time				6.5				6.50
Michelle Obama Neighborhood		1000-1730	7.5	Full-Time						7.5	7.5	15.00
Miller Health Facility	Employee Q	1400-1800	4	Part-Time	4	4	4	4	4			20.00
Multi Service Center	Employee R	0830-1730	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Multi Service Center	Employee S	0800-1700	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Multi Service Center	Employee T	0700-1600	8	Full-Time		8	8	8	8	8		40.00
Freeway Yard	Employee U	Varied Patrol Hits	1	Part-Time	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7.00
Public Service Yard		Varied Patrol Hits	1	Part-Time	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7.00

Full-Time: Standard Schedule
Full-Time: Varied Schedule
Perm./PT: Standard Schedule
Perm./PT: Varied Schedule
Part-Time/Non-Career

ATTACHMENT B