



Date: October 27, 2016

To: Patrick H. West, City Manager *P.H.W.*

From: Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services *A.J.B.*

For: Mayor and Members of the City Council

Subject: **Support for the Convention of the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women**

---

On March 1, 2016, the City Council adopted a Resolution in support of the Convention of the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). The City Council also requested that the City Manager identify a current City Commission, such as the Human Relations Commission, to partner with California State University, Long Beach (CSULB) to complete a gender analysis study of Long Beach, and that the Commission examine policy reforms as outlined by the study and consistent with CEDAW.

CEDAW was adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in 1979, and is considered to be the "international bill of rights for women." CEDAW is the most important international agreement of gender equity. Currently, there are 189 signatories to the agreement, but the United States is the only democracy that has not ratified CEDAW. However, in 1998, San Francisco became the first municipality in the world to adopt a local ordinance reflecting the principles of CEDAW; the City of Los Angeles followed in 2006. Other United States cities who have participated include Honolulu, Hawaii; Berkeley, California; and Miami, Florida.

CEDAW focuses on a broad and ambitious scope, including issues of gender inequality, violence against women, reproductive rights of women, wage and employment discrimination, educational disparities, childcare, health of women and girls, and women's participation in politics and public life. The Gender Analysis of Long Beach Proposal (Attachment A) details the goals of CEDAW in the following areas: 1) political participation and representation; 2) income and economic development; 3) access to healthcare; and, 4) public safety focus on violence against women and girls. The proposal aims to undertake a comprehensive gender analysis of the city, organized around the primary areas that are the focus of CEDAW.

The total estimated cost of CSULB's proposal is \$182,000, which is currently unfunded. If the City Council would like to proceed, funding would need to be identified to move forward.

Support for the Convention of the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against  
Women  
October 27, 2016  
Page 2

For further information regarding this matter, please contact Tracy Colunga,  
Neighborhood Relations Officer, at (562) 570-4413.

AJB:TC::BP  
Q:\- BELINDA\TRACY\CEDAW MEMO V7.DOC

ATTACHMENT

CC: CHARLES PARKIN, CITY ATTORNEY  
LAURA L. DOUD, CITY AUDITOR  
TOM MODICA, ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER  
ARTURO SANCHEZ, DEPUTY CITY MANAGER  
REBECCA JIMENEZ, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER  
OSCAR ORCI, DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF DEVELOPMENT

## Attachment A

### CEDAW Gender Analysis of Long Beach Proposal

This project consists of a detailed gender analysis of the city of Long Beach, with the aim of providing a platform for the implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) at the city level. The project will focus on four dimensions as identified by the city of Long Beach: 1) political participation and representation; 2) income and economic development; 3) access to healthcare; and 4) public safety focused on violence against women and girls.

CEDAW is the most important and impactful international agreement on gender equality. Generally considered an “international bill of rights for women,” it was adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1979. Currently, 189 nations are signatories to the agreement, including all democracies, with the exception of the United States. President Jimmy Carter signed CEDAW in 1980, but Congress has since failed to ratify the agreement, and the United States is one of only a small group of nations that have not adopted the Convention (the others are the Vatican (Holy See), Iran, Somalia, Sudan, and Tonga).

CEDAW is broad and ambitious in scope, focusing on critical issues of gender inequality, including violence against women, sexual trafficking, wage and employment discrimination, childcare, educational disparities, the health of women and girls, and women’s participation in politics and in public life. (For a full description of CEDAW, see <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/>.) In the three and a half decades since the UN adopted CEDAW, a wealth of comparative data has emerged that analyzes policy successes and failures across countries in implementing gender equality policies, and we now benefit from a large body of research indicating best practices in developing equity policies on a variety of issues.<sup>1</sup>

In light of the failure of the United States to adopt the agreement, in 1998 San Francisco adopted a CEDAW ordinance at the city and county levels and created a Department on the Status of Women to monitor issues of gender equality and promote gender equity policies. Los Angeles followed with its own ordinance in 2000 ([http://clkrep.lacity.org/onlinedocs/2000/00-0398-S2\\_ORD\\_175735\\_02-08-2004.pdf](http://clkrep.lacity.org/onlinedocs/2000/00-0398-S2_ORD_175735_02-08-2004.pdf)), and since then an increasing number of US cities have adopted an ordinance or resolution supporting CEDAW at the city level, or are in the process of drafting an ordinance or resolution.<sup>2</sup> Data from Cities for CEDAW indicate that, in both San

---

<sup>1</sup>See, for example, **Blofield, Merike and Liesl Haas**, 2013. “Gender Equality Policies.” in *The Oxford Handbook on Gender and Politics*, edited by Georgina Waylen, Karen Celis, Johanna Kantola and Laurel Weldon. New York: Oxford University Press; and **Cole, Wade M.**, 2013. “Government Respect for Gendered Rights: The Effect of the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women on Women’s Rights Outcomes, 1981-2004.” *International Studies Quarterly*, Vol 57, No 2, June.

<sup>2</sup> See <http://citiesforcedaw.org/>.

Francisco and Los Angeles, the adoption of CEDAW “has made a measurable difference in public safety, budgetary allocations and employment.”<sup>3</sup>

Long Beach is an ideal city to adopt CEDAW. It possesses both a wealth of opportunities and entrenched inequalities. As one of the most diverse cities in the nation, it offers the possibility for examining the interaction of gender inequalities with racial, economic, and political inequalities. CEDAW would provide a blueprint for improving the status of women in Long Beach, and Long Beach would serve as a model for other cities looking to address these issues.

Before Long Beach can implement CEDAW, we first need to understand more clearly the ways that gender inequality manifests itself in our city. This proposal aims to undertake a comprehensive gender analysis of the city, organized around the primary areas that are the focus of the Convention: political participation and representation, income and economic development, access to healthcare, and public safety/violence against women and girls.

### **Political Participation and Representation**

Political participation of women is clearly important in a democratic society. Political science research has demonstrated that voter participation rates vary considerably from one demographic group to another. Furthermore, the different levels of political participation, in part, can lead to a disparity in the amount of attention paid to the needs of a given community, demographic group, etc. Additionally, the US federal system, combined with a two-stage (primary and general election) candidate selection process, provides citizens with myriad opportunities to vote (or, in many cases, not to vote). To understand the current (and recent historical) trends of female voter turnout, we propose to analyze voter turnout (in both primaries and general elections) from 2008-2016 in presidential-, state-, county-, and city-level elections. The particular emphasis will be on the voter turnout in Long Beach by gender, disaggregated by zip code and controlling for other common influences on voter participation rates: race/ethnicity, language, income, age and party affiliation. This analysis will allow us to gauge broader dynamics of voter participation (e.g., increasing voter registration rates are a useful metric for identifying which populations within Long Beach are increasing (or decreasing) their political participation.

In a representative democracy like the United States, it is equally important to assess the gender composition of the political leaders who make decisions on behalf of their constituents. Thus, we will also document and analyze the percentage of women who occupy government offices (elected and appointed) for the City of Long Beach, the Long Beach Community College Board, Long Beach Commissions and other public boards and bodies. We will further compare these rates to the percentage of women at county-, state- and federal-levels. Using international standards, including CEDAW reports of female representation around the world, we will evaluate the challenges to, and opportunities for, gender equity in these positions (e.g., availability of day care, family leave policies, and flexibility of work schedule). As previous research has clearly demonstrated, gender equity in representation is influenced by a number of

---

<sup>3</sup>It is important to note that only country signatories to CEDAW may be subject to international monitoring mechanisms or held accountable in international law for implementation of CEDAW’s substantive legal recommendations. International compliance mechanisms do not apply to individual city signatories to CEDAW, such as Los Angeles or Long Beach.

structural factors (not simply an individual choice of women to run for office or to seek appointments to public boards). Thus to understand better these potential institutional barriers to greater gender equity in elected office, we will analyze the cost of campaigning at each level of office, the (formal and informal) candidate selection process for different positions, training and recruitment opportunities for potential women candidates, etc.

### **Income and Economic Development**

Economic parity is essential to effective participation in all dimensions of society. Economic security for individuals and families is a complex issue that needs to be addressed from a number of perspectives. It is well known that there is a gender pay gap where women earn about 80 cents for every dollar earned by men workers.<sup>4</sup> Earnings are one of the most visible areas of economic gender disparity, however, a complete understanding of all areas of economic inequality is critical in designing an optimal policy to address this issue.

As a first step to understanding gender issues related to economic development we propose to analyze wage differentials at the sector level. For example, wage differentials may be less for public sector jobs than jobs in the construction sector. These types of comparisons will also control for factors that affect wages such as education, firm size, job type (i.e. administrative v. welder, etc.) and other determinants.

Another dimension of worker compensation is the benefits package associated with various career paths. Once we have an understanding of the gender distribution of employment by sector we will then consider employment by type of organization. For example, what are the employment patterns for non-profits, for profit private sector, public sector organizations such as schools or local government, etc.

Gender differences with respect to wages and benefits are critical to document. It is also important to document differences within each gender, specifically related to racial identities. There are many studies that address the gender wage gap in aggregate as well as by occupation<sup>5</sup>, however, these studies have not been done at the city level for Long Beach. In addition to providing a static or ‘snap shot’ of the current situation using the most recent data available we will also provide a dynamic perspective that will allow for comparisons of the situation over time. This is essential to obtain a better understanding as to whether or not the situation is improving or getting worse over time.

Education has always been identified as critical to achieving enhanced economic development for all sectors of the economy. The educational profile of the Long Beach workforce will be constructed and then decomposed by gender and within gender by race. These data will then be compared to similar data at the county and state level as well as over time. As female representation in post-secondary education is increasing it is important to determine if this trend is similarly represented in the workforce. Related to this data collection effort will be an analysis of the graduation pattern for CSULB by gender, race and major over time. An important element

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.iwpr.org/initiatives/pay-equity-and-discrimination> (accessed September 22, 2016)

<sup>5</sup> Institute for Women’s Policy Research, *The Gender Wage Gap by Occupation 2015 and by Race and Ethnicity*, April 2016. <file:///C:/Users/000111291/OneDrive%20-%20csulb/Downloads/C440.pdf>

in achieving economic independence is that the training received match with the job skills required by the market. Our analysis will evaluate that link using secondary data where possible.

Labor force participation rates by women is also an important measure of economic parity. These participation rates have been measured by gender and race over time. Understanding the trends of these rates will result in an improved understanding of the how economic participation is evolving and whether or not intervention is necessary and if so what type of intervention. One of the factors that influence participation rates is the perception that there are likely to jobs in the market and therefore a successful job search. This study will not only look at the history of participation and compare it to the state of the economy at that time, we will also look at the current situation by analyzing current job openings or opportunities through an analysis of data from Burning Glass searches.<sup>6</sup>

There are also many non-financial aspects to career opportunities. For example, what are the recruitment procedures, promotion strategies, mentoring programs, institutional support programs such as childcare, working conditions, family leave policies, etc. Each of these institutional factors is critical to improving the status of women in the work place. This project will address the roles of each of these factors in creating a positive work environment that will support gender equality regarding economic opportunity. Secondary data on these criteria are practically non-existent, therefore, we will need to collect primary data to support any conclusions as to appropriate policies to support equality. The data may be more descriptive and qualitative which will be analyzed to provide insight into identifying successful strategies for addressing institutional barriers to gender equality.

In sum, the economic analysis will provide quantitative assessments of the current situation in Long Beach as well as how that situation have evolved over time for a trend analysis. This assessment will be supplemented with a qualitative analysis of institutional constraints that exist to achieving gender equality in the economy. The importance of understanding the situation with gender differences in the economic opportunity is that any economy that is underutilizing a productive resource is not achieving its full potential. Therefore, enhancing opportunities for women will result in economic benefits for everyone in the community.

### **Analysis of Gender Equity in Access to Healthcare**

Women's and girls' right to the highest standard attainable of physical and mental health is protected in the human rights convention and recognized by CEDAW.<sup>7</sup> According to Healthy People 2020, social determinants of health (SDOH) create social and physical environments that promote good health for all.<sup>8</sup> Addressing social determinants of health in a community will

---

<sup>6</sup> Burning Glass is a job market analysis company. <http://burning-glass.com/>

<sup>7</sup> See General Recommendation No. 19 (11<sup>th</sup> section, 1992) Violence against women  
<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/>

<sup>8</sup> Secretary's Advisory Committee on Health Promotion and Disease Prevention Objectives for 2020. Healthy People 2020: An Opportunity to Address the Societal Determinants of Health in the United States. July 26, 2010. Available from: <http://www.healthypeople.gov/2010/hp2020/advisory/SocietalDeterminantsHealth.htm>

reduce social exclusion and gender-based inequities. A framework developed by Healthy People 2020, identifies health and health care including access to health care, primary health care as well as health literacy of a community as critical components that must be addressed in the area of SDOH. In this proposal we will use the Healthy People 2020 framework to guide this gender analysis focusing on the health of women and girls in the city of Long Beach. The analysis of gender equity in health will require the identification of publicly available resources and infrastructures as well as programs and policies that support women and girls in the city. To conduct this analysis, multiple sources of publicly available data including agency reports, secondary data analysis from institutions that serve women and girls will be examined. Throughout the analysis of available data, it will be important to assess the ability to obtain good quality data and indicators for health status disaggregated by sex and age.<sup>9</sup> Without such data, it will be difficult to guide policies and develop interventions that will improve gender discrimination and bias in health care.

To understand the current state of women's and girls' health and well-being in Long Beach, we propose to describe their burden of disease and compare it to their counterparts in the county, state and the nation. Additionally, because accessibility and affordability are intertwined and are influenced by health literacy we propose: to examine the picture of women's and girls' health in the context of available health insurance plans, employment, income and residence. Furthermore, access is potentially mediated by the availability of health providers workforce that represent the social and cultural composition of the populations they serve, we propose to analyze the composition of health providers workforce in relation to the cultural mix of the female population in the city of Long Beach to identify potential gaps in service areas. Additionally, we will look at factors that affect pregnancy and childbirth including but not limited to preconception and interconception physical and mental health, age, poverty and women's ability to engage in healthy behaviors throughout the pregnancy. The analysis will expand to examine the social determinates of infant and girls' health including the racial and ethnic disparities in infant mortality, nutrition including breastfeeding. We will also examine access to environmental and societal conditions that create healthy environments for women and girls such as access to safe neighborhoods, park facilities, bike paths and trails.

### **Public Safety (Violence Against Women and Human Trafficking of Women and Girls)**

The first step in evaluating gender issues associated with public safety is to analyze the existing data on gender related crimes as they relate to gender specific issues. With the cooperation of the city of Long Beach we will aggregate data specific to gender issues to determine where the potential threats exist and link these to the existing programs available to address the problems identified in the criminal and civil actions recorded by the city. Creating a profile of gender specific threats that have occurred over time in the city, we are then able to correlate the problems with the solutions and identify areas that may be underserved or nonexistent.

Effective prevention of crime starts with creating awareness through gender-sensitivity training programs. We propose to collect data as broadly as possible from different sites across Long

---

<sup>9</sup> Sen, G., Ostlin, P., & George, A. (2007). Unequal, unfair, ineffective and inefficient gender inequity in health: Why it exists and how we can change it. Final Report to the WHO Commission on Social Determinants of Health. Women and Gender Equity Knowledge Network.  
[http://www.who.int/social\\_determinants/resources/csdh\\_media/wgekn\\_final\\_report\\_07.pdf?ua=1](http://www.who.int/social_determinants/resources/csdh_media/wgekn_final_report_07.pdf?ua=1)

Beach, both public and private sector actions, where such programs and training may be in place or in development. For example: Department of Health and Human Services, Long Beach Police Department, hospital systems (e.g., Kaiser Permanente, Memorial Care, etc.), religious organizations, non-profit organizations, community groups (e.g., Child Abuse and Domestic Violence Prevention Council, Legal Aid Foundation, etc.), campus organizations (e.g., CSULB Women's and Gender Equity Center). Evaluation of these available gender-sensitivity training programs will consider how long have these programs been in operation, how the training is offered, how often and what components do they consider as key in those training sessions. Data about the number of people or personnel reached and trained will also be solicited if available.

In addition to assessing the ability of law enforcement, social service agencies and non-profit organizations to document and stop acts of violence against women, we will investigate organized programs designed to break the cycle of violence by providing rehabilitation services for perpetrators of violence against women or girls. Similar to the approach we adopt elsewhere in this report, we will collect data from public and private entities in Long Beach that have developed, or are in the process of developing, rehabilitation programs for the perpetrators of violence against women and girls. We will document how long the rehabilitation program has been in operation, what the program entails, their outreach efforts, the number of individuals that they serve, the long term economic viability of the program, etc.

CEDAW is also concerned with the complex issue of sexual harassment. Thus, we will analyze the process for documentation and procedures for institutional response to claims of sexual harassment in places of employment, school, public transportation, and any other places where women may be subject to harassment. Our report will clarify state and federal laws and their applicability (or lack thereof) to places of employment, school, public transportation and other places.

An area of emphasis of CEDAW (both internationally and in attempts to implement CEDAW at sub-national levels) is the trafficking of women and girls. Southern California, including Long Beach, has become a significant transfer point for those who traffic women and girls. Despite the underlying complexity of the issue, our report—in marked contrast to other CEDAW studies—will clarify the state and federal laws and organizations (public, non-profit and private) that are working in the area of human trafficking of women and girls. We will review the initiatives, successes and obstacles of the Long Beach City Council's Human Sex Trafficking Task Force, consisting of members from the Long Beach Police Department and other city agencies. We will also analyze data, trends and networking efforts by non-profit organizations, such as the Long Beach Human Trafficking Task Force. We will work with the CSULB Task Force on Human Trafficking for data, recent academic research and various linkages among the governmental, non-profit and private organizations in Long Beach that are engaged in documenting and preventing human trafficking. Another important local resource will be Vanguard University's Global Center for Women and Justice, which has been active in the cause of human trafficking in Orange County. Working with all of these various entities will help us map the formal and informal resources that are available in Long Beach (and Southern California more broadly) to raise awareness of and combat the human trafficking of women and girls and to provide assistance for those women and girls who have been trafficked.